

# 22. The Effect of Collaborative Strategy Reading and Guided Reading

*by* Dr. Erika Sinambela

---

**Submission date:** 23-Jul-2023 05:56AM (UTC-0700)

**Submission ID:** 2135325493

**File name:** Effect\_of\_Collaborative\_Strategy\_Reading\_and\_Guided\_Reading.pdf (261.32K)

**Word count:** 2919

**Character count:** 15962

19  
**The Effect of Collaborative Strategy Reading and  
Guided Reading Peer Questioning Strategy  
on Students' Achievement in Reading Comprehension**

Oleh :

**Theoria Indah Swari Sinaga<sup>1</sup>, Erika Sinambela<sup>2</sup>, Agustinus Gea<sup>3</sup>, Carolina<sup>4</sup>**

<sup>1234</sup>English Education Department, Universitas HKBP Nommensen, Medan, Indonesia

<sup>2</sup>erikasinambela@uhn.ac.id

32  
**Keywords:**

Reading  
Comprehension;  
Collaborative  
Strategic  
Reading; Guided  
Reading Peer  
Questioning  
Strategy

**Abstract**

The purpose of this study was to describe the influence of students in determining collaborative reading strategies and integrated reading questions and answers from class VIII SMP Swasta Nusantara Lubuk Pakam. This research was conducted using Two-Way ANOVA. The research subjects were students of class VIII of Lubuk Pakam Nusantara Private Junior High School which consisted of 30 students. The instrument used to collect data is multiple choice. The population is 30 students. The results of this study, obtained using ANOVA analysis, the comparison of Fcount and Ftable at a significant level is the learning strategy used by Nusantara Private Junior High School Lubuk Pakam Fcount  $p = 0.320 > 0.05$  or Fcount = 1.154 < Ftable = 3.10, not significant.

33  
**Kata Kunci:**

Pemahaman  
Membaca;  
Membaca  
Strategis  
Kolaboratif;  
Membaca  
Dipandu Strategi  
Bertanya Rekan

**Abstrak**

Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk mendeskripsikan pengaruh siswa dalam menentukan pembacaan strategi kolaboratif dan tanya jawab membaca terpadu dari kelas VIII SMP Swasta Nusantara Lubuk Pakam. Penelitian ini dilakukan dengan menggunakan Two-Way ANOVA. Subjek penelitian adalah siswa kelas VIII di SMP Swasta Nusantara Lubuk Pakam yang terdiri dari 30 siswa. Instrumen yang digunakan untuk mengumpulkan data adalah pilihan ganda. Populasi adalah 30 siswa. Hasil penelitian ini, diperoleh dengan menggunakan analisis ANOVA, perbandingan Fhitung dan Ftable pada tingkat signifikan ini adalah strategi pembelajaran yang digunakan oleh SMP Swasta Nusantara Lubuk Pakam Fhitung  $p = 0,320 > 0,05$  atau Fhitung = 1,154 < Ftable = 3,10, tidak Signifikan.

**Introduction**

The ability in mastering the English language is a crucial need since language has an important role as a means of communication among others. In Indonesia, English is used

as a foreign language that is taught in schools. It is not only given as the main subject which is examined in the national final examination but also it is given to prepare students facing the global era for now and their future life (Herman et. al., 2020). English is used as a means of communication both oral and written. Here, to communicate means to comprehend and convey information, thought and feeling by using English. Language is expected to help students knowing themselves and others. Sinaga et. al. (2020) explained that English as a foreign language is needed not only in academic field but also in the development of science and technology, many work fields and life activities, such as in the process of getting knowledge, transferring information from the text books and mass media (newspaper, magazine, radio, TV and internet).

Reading comprehension become more important as student progress through the educational system (Silalahi et. al., 2022). It important is realized as very substantial because it opens up new knowledge for individual. The goal is to enrich his/her experiences and to improve his/her intellectual ability.

In English, a student must master four skills, they are: listening, speaking, reading, and writing. Among those skills, reading is one of the most important skills in learning language. Reading skill becomes a part of language skill that the students have reading skill has an important role in education field. Reading is one of a ways for the students to get the information needed in their education field, such as transferring information and knowledge from text book.

English plays an important role nowadays. It becomes an international language. Therefore, in this modern era it is necessary for us to learn it. English also has been taught in many countries in the world as a second foreign language such as in Japan, Malaysia, China, Germany and Indonesia in those countries students always make many efforts to make the teaching English as a second or foreign language better and better. Many skills in English subject is reading that also has an own passion to make the students really more learn about English. There are four language skills that must be achieved by the students in learning a language, in this case English. They are listening, speaking, reading and writing.

Based on writer observation on SMP Swasta Nusantara Lubuk Pakam, the writers find out that the VIII Grade students understand on reading comprehension still low, although it has been taught in the first semester. The writer also found that the way the teacher taught reading to the students is boring. The explanation above, this is conduct to see the students' achievement in reading comprehension by Collaborative Strategy

Reading (CSR), Collaborative Strategic Reading (CSR) is a set of instructional strategies designed to help students with diverse abilities acquire and practice comprehension strategies for use with informational text (Klingner and Vaughn, 1996; Rajagukguk et. al., 2020). The goals of CSR are to improve reading comprehension and increase conceptual learning in ways that maximize student involvement. CSR is a reading comprehension practice that combines two instructional elements (a) modified reciprocal teaching (Palinscar & Brown, 1984), (b) cooperative learning (Johnson & Johnson, 1987) or student pairing. In reciprocal teaching, teachers and students take turns leading a dialogue concerning key features of text through summarizing, questioning, clarifying and predicting. Reciprocal teaching was developed with the intention of aiding students having difficulty with reading comprehension. Guided Reading Peer Questioning Strategy (GRPQ) is a structured approach to peer interaction focusing on the cognitive processing of participants (O'Donnell, 1999). It emphasizes the role of teachers and generic question stems in guiding peer interaction. Through reciprocal peer-questioning, students learn from each other by giving and receiving help, by recognizing and resolving contradictions between the individual student and other students' perspectives, and by internalizing problem-solving processes and strategies that emerge during group work (Manullang et. al., 2022).

## **Method**

### **1. Research Design**

This research deals with the experimental research by using Factorial Design 2x2. The reasons to choose this design are: 1. To prove the hypotheses in one experimental, 2. To recognize the interaction between the dependent and independent variables. There were two variables in this study, they were two variables in this study, they were: independent variables: collaborative strategic reading Strategy and Guided Reading Peer Questioning Strategy. There were three groups of students in this research namely Experimental Group (I) that was taught by using collaborative strategy reading and Experimental Group (II) that was taught by using guided reading peer questioning strategy.

### **2. Population and Sample**

The population of this study is all students of VIII grade of SMP Swasta Nusantara Lubuk Pakam with consist of 36 students. Total numbers of the students in population were 360 students.

<sup>35</sup> The sample of this research was taken by using the cluster random sampling technique. The researcher took three classes from the three classes by using lottery technique. The steps were: 1) wrote the name of the class in a small piece of paper, 2) put the paper in the box, 3) shook the box, 4) took two papers, 5) the first selected paper was taught by using collaborative strategic reading strategy and one the second paper was taught by using guided peer questioning strategy. Then, after the classes selected, the researcher gave questionnaire about strategy to all students of the two classes.

### 3. The Instrument of Data Collection

The instrument was design to collect the data. The instrument is a tool used in collecting the data (Ivantara et. al., 2020). There were also mention that the instrument is a tool used to detect the data, measure the frequency and magnitude of the phenomenon. Thus it can be said that the data needed a device to detect. In this study the instrument that the writer used in this research was give multiple choices in comprehending reading text by using reading test, to measure their understanding of the passage and used <sup>25</sup> to measure students' achievement in reading comprehension.

### <sup>25</sup> 4. Technique of Data Collection

The data analysis is the last step on the procedure of this experiment and data analysis is very important in a research because a researcher was got the result of the data obtained to make a conclusion from the research. To get the result of this research, the researcher uses ANOVA technique as the technique in analyzing the data. According to Cohen (2007:543), ANOVA is used to discover whether there are statically significant differences between the means of three groups, using parametric data drawn from random samples with the normal distribution.

#### a. Pre-Test

<sup>36</sup> There are three groups, the experimental groups and the control group. The pre-test was administered before treatment. The function of pre-test is find out the homogeneity in the mean score students. Through this test, the writer wanted to know whether they were in the same level of knowledge in reading comprehension. If the difference of the level of knowledge is significant, the group was arranging to similar the level. If it could not be made same, at least the difference was not significant.

### b. Treatment

After doing the pre-test, teacher continue the subject with giving treatment. In this occasion, the teacher was giving more deeply the explanation of material for the students. Treatment, which were experimental groups and control group that taught by using same material but different method. In this phase, the experimental group was taught by Collaborative Strategy Reading and Guided Reading Peer Questioning Strategy and control group was taught by conventional method in the classroom.

### c. Post-Test

The post-test was giving to both experimental group and control group. The one of groups received treatment. After giving the test to class which one teach in Collaborative Strategy Reading and one teach in Guided Reading Peer Questioning Strategy then will collect their score. The data was analyzed by using ANOVA formula by comparing the scores of the three groups. The groups were compared to know how significant the effect of applying Collaborative Strategy Reading and Guided Reading Peer Questioning Strategy in teaching reading comprehension.

Table 1. Factorial Research Design 2x2

Group	Pre-test	Treatment	Post-test
Collaborative Strategy Reading	✓	✓	✓
Guided Reading Peer Questioning	✓	✓	✓
Control	✓	-	✓

## 5. The Technique of Analyzing Data

The data analysis is the last step on the procedure of this experiment and data analysis is very important in a research because a researcher will get the result of the data obtained to make a conclusion from the research. According to Cohen (2007:543) t-test is used to discover whether there are statically significant differences between the means of two groups, using parametric data drawn from random samples with the normal distribution.

To get the result of this research, the researcher uses t-test technique as the technique in analyzing the data and Two Way ANOVA through Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) version 16 for window. The researcher used the level of significance 0.05 in which the hypothesis was approved if  $\text{Sign} < \alpha$ . It means that the probability of error in



the hypothesis will only 5%. Technically, the analysis of the data performed in this study through two stages namely the normality and homogeneity test are needed to be conducted as the requirement for parametric testing. Normality test is conduct to know whether or not the data has normal distribution. Then, homogeneity test is conduct to assure that the data populations were homogenous or not. Furthermore, for calculating the normality test, this study used Kolmogorov-Smirnov technique.

As stated by Emzir above, inferential statistic will be used to analyze the variance or ANOVA (One Way Analysis of Variance) formula. In this study, ANOVA was used to test the significant differences presented among students' reading comprehension score.

The formula of ANOVA is:

$$F = \frac{MSa}{MSw}$$

MSw

To describe the analysis, a table of ANOVA is provided as follow:

Table 2. Formula of ANOVA

Source of Variance	Df	SS	MS	F
Among Groups	$df_a = k - 1$	$SS_a = \frac{(\sum X_1)^2}{f_1} + \frac{(\sum X_2)^2}{f_2} + \frac{(\sum X_k)^2}{fk} + \frac{(\sum X_{tot})^2}{\sum f}$	$MS_a = \frac{SS_a}{k - 1}$	$F = \frac{MS_a}{MS_w}$
Within Groups	$df_w = n - k$	$SS_w = SS_{tot} - SS_a$	$MS_w = \frac{SS_w}{n - k}$	
Total	$df_{tot} = n - 1$	$SS_{tot} = \sum X_{tot}^2 - \frac{(\sum X_{tot})^2}{n}$		

Note :

F : Analysis of Variance

MS : Mean Square

MSa : Mean Square among groups

MSw : Mean Square within groups

SS : Sum of Square

SSa : Sum of Square among groups

SSw : Sum of Square within groups  
 SStot : Total Sum of Square  
 df : Degree of Freedom  
 dfb : Degree of Freedom among groups  
 dfw : Degree of Freedom within groups  
 dftot : Total Degree of Freedom  
 n : Number of sample  
 k : Number of groups  
 f : Frequency of sample  
 ftot : Total of Frequency  
 Significant critical value : 5% (0.05)

### Results and Discussion

After the writer analyzed the students' ability, the findings of this study were presented as follows:

1. The highest score in Collaborative Strategy Reading and Guided Reading Peer Questioning 92 and the lowest score Collaborative Strategic Reading and Guided Reading Peer Questioning Strategy structure 54.
2. The highest score in Collaborative Strategy Reading and Guided Reading Peer Questioning Strategy on SMP Swasta Nusantara Lubuk Pakam is 92 or > 54. The unable to answer Collaborative Strategic Reading and Guided Reading Peer Questioning able because they only get mean 60.

The result of Two Ways ANOVA reveals that both Collaborative Strategy Reading and Guided Reading Peer Questioning Strategy affect students' achievement in reading comprehension. From the data analysis it is found that, experimental group 1: 3.467, experimental group 2: 8.867, control group : 6.8  $p = 0,320 > 0,05$  atau  $F_{hitung} = 1.154 < F_{tabel} = 3.10$ , not significant. The results of the two groups ANOVA above concluded that the first and second techniques did not produce a significant score. The benefit of this researcher to the learning process is, the students can learn about reading with this strategy

### Conclusion

Based on the data analysis, hypothesis testing, research finding and discussion, it can be concluded that:



1. Collaborative strategy reading and guided reading peer questioning strategy significantly affect students' achievement in reading comprehension, narrative text. The students' achievement in reading comprehension narrative text taught by Collaborative strategic reading is higher than that of the students taught by guided reading peer questioning strategy.
2. Students in class VIII-2 significantly affects students' achievement in reading comprehension, narrative text. A student in class VIII-2 achievement in reading comprehension is higher than that of class VIII-1 and VIII-3.

## References

- Alderson, J. C. (2000). *Assessing reading*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Burns, C. P. et.al. (1984). *Teaching Reading in Today's Elementary Schools*. 3rd. Ed. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company.
- Brassel, D. and Resinski, T. (2008). *Comprehension that Work: Taking Students beyond Ordinary Understanding to Deep Comprehension*. Hungtinton Beach: Shell Education.
- Best, J. W., & Kahn, J. V. (2006). *Research in Education (10th ed.)*. Boston: Pearson Education, Inc.
- Day, R. R., & Park, J. (2005). Developing reading comprehension questions. *Reading in a Foreign Language*, 17(1), 60-73.
- Damanik, A. S. and Herman. (2021). Improving Students' Reading Comprehension Through Question Answer Relationship Strategy (QARS). *Inovish Journal*, Vol. 6, No. 1, PP. 84-101. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.35314/inovish.v6i1.1949>
- Danielle, S. (2007). *Reading Comprehension Strategies: Theories, Interventions, and Technologies*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates. Inc.
- Grabe, W., and Stoller, F. L. (2002). *Teaching and Researching Reading: Applied Linguistic in Action Series*. Harlow: Pearson Education. Longman.
- Herman, Sibarani, J. K., and Pardede, H. (2020). The Effect of Jigsaw Technique in Reading Comprehension on Recount Text. *Cetta: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan, Jayapangus Press ISSN 2615-0891 (E) Vol. 3 No. 1 (2020), PP. 84-102*. DOI: 10.37329/cetta.v3i1.413

- 26 Ivantara, E. P., Herman., and Manalu, D. B. (2020). The effect of using cooperative script on students' reading comprehension at grade eleveth of SMA Negeri 2 Pematangsiantar . *Acitya: Journal of Teaching & Education*, Vol. 2 No. 2 2020, PP. 82-94. DOI: 10.30650/ajte.v2i2.1361
- 1 Klingner, J. K. & Vaughn, S. (1996). Reciprocal teaching of reading comprehension strategies for students with learning disabilities who use English as a second language. *Elementary School Journal*, 96, 275–293.
- 12 Lems, K. et al. (2010). *Teaching Reading to English Language Learners Insights from Linguistic*. New York: The Guilford Press
- 3 Lumbantobing, S. R. A. H., Pardede, H., and Herman. (2020). The Effect of Herringbone Technique on the Students' Ability in Reading Comprehension on Recount Text . *Journal of English Educational Study*, Volume 3, Issue 2, November 2020, Page 1-10, E-ISSN: 2655-0776. DOI : [10.31932/jees.v3i2.656](https://doi.org/10.31932/jees.v3i2.656)
- 24 Manullang, R. A., Sianipar, E., Herman, and Sinurat, B. (2022). The Application of Phonics Instruction in Reading Text at Grade X SMK N.1 Pematangsiantar. *Periodica Journal of Modern Philosophy, Social Sciences and Humanities*, 4, 25–31.
- Rajagukguk, T. A., Herman. H., & Sihombing, P. S. R. (2020). The Effect of Using Collaborative Writing Method on Students' ` Recount Text at Grade Ten of SMK YP 1 HKBP Pematangsiantar. *Acitya: Journal of Teaching and Education*, 2(2), 95-114. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.30650/ajte.v2i2.1363>
- 17 Silalahi, D. E., Herman, H., Sihombing, P. S. R., Damanik, A. S., and Purba, L. (2022). An Analysis of students' achievement in reading comprehension through higher order thinking skills (HOTS). *Al-Ishlah: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 14(2), DOI: [10.35445/alishlah.v14i2.1249](https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v14i2.1249)
- 6 Sinaga, Y. K., Herman, and Siahaan, P. L. (2020). The Effect of Partner Reading Strategy on Reading Comprehension. *Journal of English Education and Teaching (JEET)*, Volume 4 number 2, June 2020, Page 206-218. DOI: [10.33369/jeet.4.2.206-218](https://doi.org/10.33369/jeet.4.2.206-218)
- 5 Sirait, M. F., Hutauruk, B. S., & Herman. (2020). The Effect of Using Speed Reading Technique to the Students' Ability in Comprehending a Text. *Cetta: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 3(3), 485-498

## 22. The Effect of Collaborative Strategy Reading and Guided Reading

### ORIGINALITY REPORT

20%

SIMILARITY INDEX

10%

INTERNET SOURCES

11%

PUBLICATIONS

11%

STUDENT PAPERS

### PRIMARY SOURCES

1

Submitted to CSU, Los Angeles

Student Paper

1%

2

Submitted to Chaffey Joint Union High School District

Student Paper

1%

3

Herman Herman, Dewi Sri Lumbantobing, Bloner Sinurat. "AN ANALYSIS OF FIGURATIVE LANGUAGE IN MICHAEL JACKSON SONG LYRICS", Edu-Ling: Journal of English Education and Linguistics, 2021

Publication

1%

4

Herman Herman, Helty Sinaga, Bertaria Sohnata Hutaurok. "STUDENTS' DIFFICULTIES IN USING PERSONAL PRONOUNS IN WRITING RECOUNT TEXT", Scientia: Jurnal Hasil Penelitian, 2020

Publication

1%

5

[allofskripsi.blogspot.com](http://allofskripsi.blogspot.com)

Internet Source

1%

Submitted to University of Hull

6	Student Paper	1 %
7	Submitted to University of Melbourne Student Paper	1 %
8	educationdocbox.com Internet Source	1 %
9	eprints.umk.ac.id Internet Source	1 %
10	link.springer.com Internet Source	1 %
11	Submitted to Mae Fah Luang University Student Paper	1 %
12	e-journal.metrouniv.ac.id Internet Source	1 %
13	es.scribd.com Internet Source	1 %
14	repository.unmuhjember.ac.id Internet Source	1 %
15	Submitted to CSU, Long Beach Student Paper	1 %
16	Submitted to ELS Educational Services, Inc Student Paper	1 %
17	Herman Herman, Dumaris E Silalahi, Yanti Kristina Sinaga. "Collaborative Teacher and	1 %

# Students Sebagai Realisasi Pembelajaran Inovatif", Indonesia Berdaya, 2022

Publication

18	<a href="http://erepository.uonbi.ac.ke">erepository.uonbi.ac.ke</a> Internet Source	1 %
19	Khaled Ahmed Abdel-Al Ibrahim, Nestor Cuba Carbajal, Manuel Enrique Chenet Zuta, Sania Bayat. "Collaborative learning, scaffolding-based instruction, and self-assessment: impacts on intermediate EFL learners' reading comprehension, motivation, and anxiety", Language Testing in Asia, 2023 Publication	1 %
20	Submitted to Victoria University of Wellington Student Paper	1 %
21	<a href="http://english-skripsi.blogspot.ca">english-skripsi.blogspot.ca</a> Internet Source	<1 %
22	Ab Rashid, M. F. F., W. Hutabarat, and A. Tiwari. "Development of a tuneable test problem generator for assembly sequence planning and assembly line balancing", Proceedings of the Institution of Mechanical Engineers Part B Journal of Engineering Manufacture, 2012. Publication	<1 %
23	Ary Setya Budhi Ningrum, Ika Widyawati. "IMPROVING STUDENTS' READING	<1 %

# COMPREHENSION SKILL USING HERRINGBONE TECHNIQUE AT MTS AL-FATAH BADAS", INFERENSI, 2015

Publication

24

Ezra Octania Sianipar, Herman Herman, Ridwin Purba. "A Contrastive Analysis Study Between English and Batak Toba in Request Sentence", Edu-Ling: Journal of English Education and Linguistics, 2022

Publication

<1 %

25

RINA FALENTINA, Desi Sri Astuti, Dian Shinta Sari. "THE EFFECTIVENESS OF INFOGRAPHIC IN TEACHING READING COMPREHENSION", Journal of English Language Teaching and Education (JELTE), 2022

Publication

<1 %

26

Zulfadli Abdul Aziz, Sofyan Abdul Gani, Zurina Zora. "Paragraph shrinking as a strategy to improve reading comprehension", Journal of English Language Teaching Innovations and Materials (Jeltim), 2022

Publication

<1 %

27

[baadalsg.inflibnet.ac.in](http://baadalsg.inflibnet.ac.in)

Internet Source

<1 %

28

Submitted to UWC Dilijan

Student Paper

<1 %



29	<p>Popiana Br Hutaurok, Jesana Tesselonika Simaremare, Astrinia Ristama Tampubolon, Albert Welman Daulat Lumbangaol et al. "Speech Acts on Discourse Analysis Used in a Speech "What Really Matters at the End Life" by BJ Miller", Journal of English Language and Education, 2023</p> <p>Publication</p>	<1 %
30	<p>Submitted to Saint George's University</p> <p>Student Paper</p>	<1 %
31	<p>ijreeonline.com</p> <p>Internet Source</p>	<1 %
32	<p>www.scilit.net</p> <p>Internet Source</p>	<1 %
33	<p>ummaspul.e-journal.id</p> <p>Internet Source</p>	<1 %
34	<p>eprints.umm.ac.id</p> <p>Internet Source</p>	<1 %
35	<p>garuda.kemdikbud.go.id</p> <p>Internet Source</p>	<1 %
36	<p>Eunice Eyitayo Olakanmi, Amosa Isiaka Gambari, Elizabeth Bimpe Gbodi, Nathan Eneojo Abalaka. "Promoting Intrinsic and Extrinsic Motivation among Chemistry Students Using Computer-assisted</p>	<1 %

37

Rahesa Nalendra, Iskandar Wiyokusumo, Ibut  
Priono Leksono. "THE EFFECT OF LEARNING  
MODEL LEARNING LEARNING WITH YOUTUBE  
VERSUS MEDIA FLASH CARD MEDIA AND  
LEARNING MOTIVATION ON LEARNING  
OUTCOMES IN ENGLISH", Journal of English  
Educational Study (JEES), 2020

Publication

<1 %

38

[soar-ir.repo.nii.ac.jp](http://soar-ir.repo.nii.ac.jp)

Internet Source

<1 %

39

Nopia Rizki, Baiduri Baiduri, Siti Inganah.  
"ANALYSIS OF CRITICAL THINKING ABILITY IN  
LIVEWORKHEET ASSISTED COOPERATIVE  
LEARNING SETTINGS", AKSIOMA: Jurnal  
Program Studi Pendidikan Matematika, 2023

Publication

<1 %

Exclude quotes On

Exclude matches Off

Exclude bibliography Off

# 22. The Effect of Collaborative Strategy Reading and Guided Reading

---

GRADEMARK REPORT

---

FINAL GRADE

/0

GENERAL COMMENTS

Instructor

---

PAGE 1

PAGE 2

PAGE 3

PAGE 4

PAGE 5

PAGE 6

PAGE 7

PAGE 8

PAGE 9

---