HISTORY OF REVIEW OF MANUSCRIPT

(Reviewer for Environmental Research Letter)

Wave-like global economic ripple response to Hurricane Sandy

(Published in Environmental Research Letter, Vol. 16, No. 12 (2021))

Reviewer: Jongkers Tampubolon

Agribusiness Department, Agricultural Faculty

Universitas HKBP Nommensen

MEDAN

Daftar Isi

I. INVITATION TO REVIEW A MANUSCRIPT

October 31, 2021

Invitation to review for Environmental Research Letters - ERL-112682

From: Environmental Research Letters (onbehalfof@manuscriptcentral.com)

To: jtampubolon@yahoo.com

Date: Sunday, October 31, 2021, 11:50 AM GMT+7

Dear Dr Tampubolon,

Re: "Wave-like global economic ripple response to Hurricane Sandy"
Article reference: ERL-112682

This Letter has been submitted to Environmental Research Letters for consideration and we have identified you as a possible expert who could review the manuscript. We would be very grateful if you could offer your opinion on the manuscript and whether it is suitable for publication. You can review the full abstract and further article information at the end of this email before making your choice.

Our expert reviewers greatly contribute to the high standards of the Journal, and we thank you for your present and/or future participation.

To respond automatically, click below:

*** PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. ***

Agreed: https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/erl-iop?URL_MASK=9f396a96f14a4a5d93b16d277baa99eb

Declined - Conflict of Interest: https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/erl-iop?URL_MASK=9df5f3b36631463886cbe384c8d143e8

Declined - Out of Field: https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/erl-iop?URL_MASK=7534764ec45e4e988397d1ef31a967bf

Declined - Unavailable: https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/erl-iop?URL_MASK=13459773b6d74e02843a135113d271e1

Declined - No Reason: https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/erl-iop?URL_MASK=ad42d76eb9bc47c2a596cf4703e9375f

If you accept our invitation to review this manuscript, you will be notified via e-mail with instructions on how to access and review the manuscript in your Reviewer Centre. We would appreciate your comments and recommendation by (Document Task not available).

If you need more time, please reply to this email, providing a date you can report by. If you are unable to report on this occasion, we would be grateful if you could provide the names and e-mail addresses of possible alternative reviewers when prompted.

You can gain credit for this review and connect with ORCID through our connection with Publons.

Yours sincerely

(User not available) (User not available)
(User not available)

On behalf of:
Environmental Research Letters Editor-in-Chief: Daniel M Kammen
iopscience.org/erl | erl@ioppublishing.org
Impact Factor: 6.793 | Citescore: 8.9

MANUSCRIPT DETAILS

ARTICLE TITLE: "Wave-like global economic ripple response to Hurricane Sandy"

ABSTRACT: Tropical cyclones range among the costliest disasters on Earth. Their economic repercussions along the supply and trade network also affect remote economies that are not directly affected. We here simulate possible global repercussions on consumption for the example case of Hurricane Sandy in the US (2012) using the shock-propagation model Acclimate. The modeled shock yields a global three-phase ripple: an initial production demand reduction and associated consumption price decrease, followed by a supply shortage with increasing prices, and finally a recovery phase. Regions with strong trade relations to the US experience strong magnitudes of the ripple. A dominating demand reduction or supply shortage leads to overall consumption gains or losses of a region, respectively. While finding these repercussions in historic data is challenging due to strong volatility of economic interactions, numerical models like ours can help to identify them by approaching the problem from an exploratory angle, isolating the effect of interest. For this, our model simulates the economic interactions of over 7,000 regional economic sectors, interlinked through about 1.8 million trade relations. Under global warming, the wave-like structures of the economic response to major hurricanes like the one simulated here are likely to intensify and potentially overlap with other weather extremes.

II. EDITOR THANKS FOR AGREEING TO REVIEW

November 1, 2021

ERL-112682: This manuscript is ready to review

From: Environmental Research Letters (onbehalfof@manuscriptcentral.com)

To: jtampubolon@yahoo.com

Date: Monday, November 1, 2021 at 08:52 AM GMT+7

Dear Dr Tampubolon,

Re: "Wave-like global economic ripple response to Hurricane Sandy"
Article reference: ERL-112682

Thank you for agreeing to review this Letter for Environmental Research Letters. Please complete your review by 14-Nov-2021.

You can access the manuscript directly by following this link: https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/erl-iop?URL_MASK=4c391c60b1ad4d4594e0cd0cdbe5087b

To access the manuscript through your Referee Centre at https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/erl-iop please log in using your case-sensitive User ID: jtampubolon@yahoo.com

For security purposes your password is not listed in this e-mail. If you have lost or forgotten your password, please follow this link to be sent a new one: https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/erl-iop?URL_MASK=ff3710fcd4584632bf2ed8ba1edc4253

Please answer all the questions on the report form, including your comments and recommendation.

A manuscript in Environmental Research Letters should make a genuine contribution to the development of the subject. The manuscript should be of importance to the journal's readership and contain significant and novel science, in addition to being scientifically rigorous and correct. It should be concise and written in clear English and the motivation and relevance of all research presented should be described clearly. In your comments, please address these points. Any criticisms based on published or unpublished work should be supported by references. If you believe that the manuscript should be rejected, please give clear reasons.

You can find full referee guidelines at https://publishingsupport.iopscience.iop.org/becoming-a-journal-reviewer/

You may also be interested in our Peer Review Excellence training hub, a two-hour course on peer review skills that provides a fast track towards IOP Trusted Reviewer certification. Register for an account and access the course here: https://ioppublishing.org/peer_review_training

For full details of the journal scope please see https://iopscience.iop.org/journal/1748-9326/page/about-the-journal#aim

If you are unable referee this manuscript, we would be grateful if you could recommend someone that we can contact to complete the review. However, please remember that this manuscript is confidential.

Thank you for your help in assessing this Letter. We look forward to hearing from you soon.

Yours sincerely

On behalf of:
Environmental Research Letters Editor-in-Chief: Daniel M Kammen
iopscience.org/erl | erl@ioppublishing.org
Impact Factor: 6.793 | Citescore: 8.9

III. EDITOR RESPONSES TO REVIEW REPORT

November 10, 2021

Thank you for reviewing for Environ. Res. Lett. - ERL-112682

From: Environmental Research Letters (onbehalfof@manuscriptcentral.com)

To: jtampubolon@yahoo.com

Date: Wednesday, November 10, 2021, 08:31 AM GMT+7

Dear Dr Tampubolon,

Re: "Wave-like global economic ripple response to Hurricane Sandy"
Article reference: ERL-112682

Thank you for your report on this Letter, which is being considered by Environmental Research Letters.

We appreciate the time and effort that you have spent reviewing this manuscript and we are very grateful for your assistance. We hope that we will be able to call upon you again to review future manuscripts.

We are always looking for ways to improve our service. We would really appreciate it if you could take five minutes to complete a short survey about your experience of reviewing an article for IOP Publishing:
https://forms.office.com/r/T26Bu71Wz5

We would like to thank you in advance for your help.

Yours sincerely

On behalf of:
Environmental Research Letters Editor-in-Chief: Daniel M Kammen
iopscience.org/erl | erl@ioppublishing.org
Impact Factor: 6.793 | Citescore: 8.9

ioppublishing.org | twitter.com/IOPPublishing

What is the status of your article?
Click the following link and enter the article ID to track its status: https://publishingsupport.iopscience.iop.org/track-my-article/?utm_source=Track%20my%20article&utm_medium=Email

Letter reference: ESFR05

Decision on an article you reviewed: ERL-112682

From: Environmental Research Letters (onbehalfof@manuscriptcentral.com)

To: erl@ioppublishing.org

Date: Wednesday, November 10, 2021, 07:12 PM GMT+7

Re: "Wave-like global economic ripple response to Hurricane Sandy"

Thank you for your comments on this Letter being considered by Environmental Research Letters. We wanted to let you know that we have now made a decision on this article based on all of the feedback received. On this occasion our decision is: Moderate Revision

You can find all reviewer comments relating to the version of this manuscript below. If the comments refer to an attachment and you would like to read this, please let us know by replying to this email.

Please review the benefits and rewards of reviewing for IOP Publishing here: http://bit.ly/3s1O0zo.

We are very grateful for your assessment of this paper and we look forward to working with you again in the future.

Yours sincerely

Freddie Taylor

On behalf of:
Environmental Research Letters
Editor-in-Chief: Daniel M Kammen
iopscience.org/erl | erl@ioppublishing.org
Impact Factor: 6.793 | Citescore: 8.9

Want to find out what is happening to your submission?
Track your article on:
Publishing support: https://publishingsupport.iopscience.iop.org/track-my-article/
WeChat: https://publishingsupport.iopscience.iop.org/track-your-article-on-wechat/

ioppublishing.org | twitter.com/IOPPublishing

Reviewer comments on this manuscript

Referee: 1

COMMENTS TO THE AUTHOR(S)
In disaster loss models, most previous studies have focused on direct economic losses. However, indirect economic losses are often difficult to assess because upstream and downstream of the supply chain are rarely considered. This study simulates possible global repercussions on consumption for the example case of Hurricane Sandy (2012) by using a shock-propagation model. And the authors find the shock yields a global three-phase ripple. This is an attempt to study the indirect effects of disasters. The topic is interesting, the structure was well organized and easy to be read.

In addition, complex network can be used in the research of global supply chains. In the network, each economic agent is a node, and there is an edge between the trading agents. In general, the more complex the network, the more stable it is. Directed networks can clearly see the import and export relationship. And the importance of different economic entities can also be reflected by the number of connected edges of network nodes. It is suggested that the author can take these into full considerations in the future work.

Here are many details:
1. Figure 1: The map is not precise and lacks large islands such as Taiwan island in China.
2. Figure 1: Please add the links of GADM and IBTrACS in Data Availability part.
3. Figure 4: The loss is more worthy of attention, please modify the priority according to the loss.
4. Discussion: Simplify discussion sections.
5. The format of this manuscript is very similar to that of npj, please revise it into the correct format. For example, the methods section should be placed before the results section of the manuscript.

I recommend minor revision.

Referee: 2

COMMENTS TO THE AUTHOR(S)
My comment mainly to the editors regarding method as online file rather than appendix [[Review ERL-112682.pdf]]

Letter ref: InfRef02